

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Christine Frodl, DNB Representative
Subject: Attributes of manifestations: Instructions for more than one instance of an element

Core Elements: General (RDA 0.6.1),
Recording Parallel Titles Proper (RDA 2.3.3.3)
More Than One Statement of Responsibility (RDA 2.4.1.6)
Recording Statements of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (RDA 2.4.2.3)
Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (RDA 2.4.3.3)
Recording Parallel Designations of Edition (RDA 2.5.3.3)
Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to the Edition (RDA 2.5.5.3)
Recording Parallel Designations of a Named Revision of an Edition (RDA 2.5.7.3)
Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to a Named Revision of an Edition (RDA 2.5.9.3)
More Than One Place of Production (RDA 2.7.2.4)
Recording Parallel Places of Production (RDA 2.7.3.3)
More Than One Producer (RDA 2.7.4.5)
Recording Parallel Producers' Names (RDA 2.7.5.3)
More Than One Place of Publication (RDA 2.8.2.4)
Recording Parallel Places of Publication (RDA 2.8.3.3)
More Than One Publisher (RDA 2.8.4.5)
Recording Parallel Publishers' Names (RDA 2.8.5.3)
More Than One Place of Distribution (RDA 2.9.2.4)
Recording Parallel Places of Distribution (RDA 2.9.3.3)
More Than One Distributor (RDA 2.9.4.5)
Recording Parallel Distributors' Names (RDA 2.9.5.3)
More Than One Place of Manufacture (RDA 2.10.2.4)
Recording Parallel Places of Manufacture (RDA 2.10.3.3)
More Than One Manufacturer (RDA 2.10.4.5)
Recording Parallel Manufacturers' Names (RDA 2.10.5.3)

Background

There are a number of instructions in chapter two addressing cases where more than one instance of the same element appears on the resource. The present proposal aims at clarifying these instructions, as their wording often leads to misunderstandings. There is no change intended to the content of RDA.

To understand the problem, compare the instructions in RDA 2.3.4.3 (Recording Other Title Information) and RDA 2.3.3.3 (Recording Parallel Titles Proper). The instruction in 2.3.4.3 is: "If more than one element of other title information is being recorded, record the elements in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the elements on the source of information." This wording makes it clear that it is perfectly possible to record several bits of other title information, but not necessarily all of them. The instruction in 2.3.3.3, on the other hand, says: "If there is more than one parallel title proper, record the titles in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the titles on the source or sources of information." This can easily lead to people to believe that if they decide to record the element "parallel title" (which is no core element), and there is more than one parallel title, then they must record all of them. The instruction in RDA 2.8.2.4 (More than one place of publication) is similarly phrased. We have noticed that this is interpreted by many people to mean that RDA gives only two options in this

situation: Either satisfy the core requirement only, i.e. record only one place of publication (the most prominent or first place of publication) or record all places of publication. Again, the wording of the instruction apparently makes it impossible to take a middle course and record several, but not all of the places of publication.

Such an "all-or-nothing" rule for optional elements would be highly impractical and is obviously not intended by RDA. Although it can be argued that the principle of representation is best served if all parallel titles, all places of publication, etc., are recorded, it will not always be possible to do so, e.g. for reasons of workload and staff shortages. If this is the case, a middle course of giving some, but not all elements, might be a sensible strategy. Therefore, this should not be discouraged by the wording of these instructions.

The proposed revisions to the relevant instructions in chapter 2 are modeled after the wording in RDA 2.3.4.3 (only leaving out the word "element", which doesn't seem to be needed in most cases). It might be argued that appropriate examples should be added as well (e.g., one with ten places of publication, of which the cataloguing agency has decided to record only three). But we feel that if the wording of the instruction is sufficiently clear, this is not really necessary.

In addition to the changes in chapter 2, we propose to clarify the wording of RDA 0.6.1 (Core Elements: General) as well. Although the proposed additions to 0.6.1 may seem self-evident, and therefore superfluous, the frequent misunderstandings show that they are not really obvious to everybody.

Proposed revisions

0.6.1, 6th paragraph

0.6.1 General

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

The elements identified in RDA as core elements are listed at [0.6.2 RDA](#) – [0.6.9 RDA](#). If only one instance of a core element is required, subsequent instances are discretionary.

[next two paragraphs unchanged]

The inclusion of other specific elements or subsequent instances of these elements is discretionary. The agency responsible for creating the data may choose:

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.3.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.3.3.3 Recording Parallel Titles Proper

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel title proper is being recorded, record the titles in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the titles on the source or sources of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.4.1.6, 1st paragraph:

2.4.1.6 More Than One Statement of Responsibility

If ~~there is~~ more than one statement of responsibility is being recorded, record the statements in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the source of information from which the corresponding title, edition, or series information is taken.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.4.2.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.4.2.3 Recording Statements of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If not all statements of responsibility appearing on the source or sources of information are being recorded, give preference to those identifying creators of the intellectual or artistic content. In case of doubt, record at least the first statement.

2.4.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.4.3.3 Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper is being recorded, record the statements in the same order as the parallel titles proper to which they correspond; if that is not applicable, record them in the order found on the resource.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.5.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.3.3 Recording Parallel Designations of Edition

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel designation of edition is being recorded, record the statements in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the statements on the source or sources of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.5.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.5.3 Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to the Edition

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel statement of responsibility relating to the edition is being recorded, record the statements in the same order as the parallel

designations of edition to which they correspond; if that is not applicable, record them in the order found on the resource.

2.5.7.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.7.3 Recording Parallel Designations of a Named Revision of an Edition

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel designation of a named revision of an edition is being recorded, record the parallel statements in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the statements on the source or sources of information.

2.5.9.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.9.3 Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to a Named Revision of an Edition

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel statement of responsibility relating to a named revision of an edition is being recorded, record the statements in the same order as the parallel designations of a named revision of an edition to which they correspond.

2.7.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.7.2.4 More Than One Place of Production

If more than one place of production is ~~named on the source of information~~ being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.7.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.7.3.3 Recording Parallel Places of Production

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel place of production is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.7.4.5:

2.7.4.5 More Than One Producer

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is ~~named~~ being recorded as a producer of the resource, record the producers' names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

2.7.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.7.5.3 Recording Parallel Producers' Names

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel producer's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.8.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.8.2.4 More Than One Place of Publication

If more than one place of publication is ~~named on the source of information~~ being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.8.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.8.3.3 Recording Parallel Places of Publication

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel place of publication is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.8.4.5:

2.8.4.5 More Than One Publisher

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is ~~named~~ being recorded as a publisher of the resource, record the publishers' names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.8.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.8.5.3 Recording Parallel Publishers' Names

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel publisher's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.9.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.9.2.4 More Than One Place of Distribution

If more than one place of distribution is ~~named on the source of information~~ being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.9.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.9.3.3 Recording Parallel Places of Distribution

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel place of distribution is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.9.4.5:

2.9.4.5 More Than One Distributor

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is ~~named~~ being recorded as a distributor of the resource, record the ~~distributor's~~ distributors' names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.9.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.9.5.3 Recording Parallel Distributors' Names

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel distributor's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.10.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.10.2.4 More Than One Place of Manufacture

If more than one place of manufacture is ~~named on the source of information~~ being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.10.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.10.3.3 Recording Parallel Places of Manufacture

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel place of manufacture is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.10.4.5:

2.10.4.5 More Than One Manufacturer

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is ~~named~~ being recorded as a manufacturer of the resource, record the manufacturers' names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

2.10.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.10.5.3 Recording Parallel Manufacturers' Names

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If ~~there is~~ more than one parallel manufacturer's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

Clean copy

0.6.1, 6th paragraph

0.6.1 General

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

The elements identified in RDA as core elements are listed at [0.6.2 RDA](#) – [0.6.9 RDA](#). If only one instance of a core element is required, additional instances are discretionary.

[next two paragraphs unchanged]

The inclusion of other specific elements or additional instances of these elements is discretionary. The agency responsible for creating the data may choose:

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.3.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.3.3.3 Recording Parallel Titles Proper

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel title proper is being recorded, record the titles in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the titles on the source or sources of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.4.1.6, 1st paragraph:

2.4.1.6 [More Than One Statement of Responsibility](#)

If more than one statement of responsibility is being recorded, record the statements in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the source of information from which the corresponding title, edition, or series information is taken.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.4.2.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.4.2.3 [Recording Statements of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If not all statements of responsibility appearing on the source or sources of information are being recorded, give preference to those identifying creators of the intellectual or artistic content. In case of doubt, record at least the first statement.

2.4.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.4.3.3 [Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper is being recorded, record the statements in the same order as the parallel titles proper to which they correspond; if that is not applicable, record them in the order found on the resource.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.5.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.3.3 [Recording Parallel Designations of Edition](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel designation of edition is being recorded, record the statements in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the statements on the source or sources of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.5.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.5.3 [Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to the Edition](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel statement of responsibility relating to the edition is being recorded, record the statements in the same order as the parallel designations of

edition to which they correspond; if that is not applicable, record them in the order found on the resource.

2.5.7.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.7.3 Recording Parallel Designations of a Named Revision of an Edition

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel designation of a named revision of an edition is being recorded, record the parallel statements in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the statements on the source or sources of information.

2.5.9.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.5.9.3 Recording Parallel Statements of Responsibility Relating to a Named Revision of an Edition

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel statement of responsibility relating to a named revision of an edition is being recorded, record the statements in the same order as the parallel designations of a named revision of an edition to which they correspond.

2.7.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.7.2.4 More Than One Place of Production

If more than one place of production is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.7.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.7.3.3 Recording Parallel Places of Production

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel place of production is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.7.4.5:

2.7.4.5 More Than One Producer

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is being recorded as a producer of the resource, record the producers' names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

2.7.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.7.5.3 Recording Parallel Producers' Names

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel producer's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.8.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.8.2.4 More Than One Place of Publication

If more than one place of publication is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.8.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.8.3.3 Recording Parallel Places of Publication

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel place of publication is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.8.4.5:

2.8.4.5 More Than One Publisher

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is being recorded as a publisher of the resource, record the publishers' names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.8.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.8.5.3 Recording Parallel Publishers' Names

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel publisher's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.9.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.9.2.4 More Than One Place of Distribution

If more than one place of distribution is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.9.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.9.3.3 [Recording Parallel Places of Distribution](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel place of distribution is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.9.4.5:

2.9.4.5 [More Than One Distributor](#)

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is being recorded as a distributor of the resource, record the distributors' names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.9.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.9.5.3 [Recording Parallel Distributors' Names](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel distributor's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.10.2.4, 1st paragraph:

2.10.2.4 [More Than One Place of Manufacture](#)

If more than one place of manufacture is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

[Rest of instruction unchanged]

2.10.3.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.10.3.3 [Recording Parallel Places of Manufacture](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel place of manufacture is being recorded, record the place names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.

2.10.4.5:

2.10.4.5 [More Than One Manufacturer](#)

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is being recorded as a manufacturer of the resource, record the manufacturers' names in the order

indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source of information.

2.10.5.3, 2nd paragraph:

2.10.5.3 [Recording Parallel Manufacturers' Names](#)

[Beginning of instruction unchanged]

If more than one parallel manufacturer's name is being recorded, record the names in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the names on the source or sources of information.