

**Comments on „RDA – Resource Description and Access“  
Constituency Review of October 31**

**Comments on Music**

specially annotated are comments from the LC/12 follow-up

**CHAPTER 0 INTRODUCTION**

**0.6 Core Elements**

0.6.1 General

According to 0.6.1, the agency responsible for creating the data may establish guidelines on levels of description and authority control, on the other hand, RDA offers rules and alternative rules. For example, there is an alternative in 6.15.2.9.6 to indicate either one creator or all creators. It is desirable that the agency be allowed to choose all other possibilities such as in the example of 6.15.2.9.6 where it is possible to choose one, several or all creators.

For the purpose of usage and identification, as many elements as possible should be given - not so many elements that are required to differentiate the entity from another. The definition of how many elements are necessary to differentiate can be difficult in a huge catalog or even in an international network of catalogs. We would like to recommend a ranking: which elements have to be given, which kind of research has to be done and in which sources (compare to 6.15.2.3).

**0.10 Internationalization**

We recommend the addition of a note in the rules to clarify that principally western classical music and pop/jazz/rock is covered by RDA. Non-western music like, e.g., Indian Ragas, is not covered by the guidelines for musical works and expressions. The relevant countries should bring in their specific instructions (compare to 6.29.1.6 Legal Works).

**CHAPTER 2 IDENTIFYING MANIFESTATIONS AND ITEMS**

**2.5 Edition statement, S. 18**

We recommend that the edition statement be recorded for a manifestation of music in a standardized form.

**CHAPTER 6 IDENTIFYING WORKS AND EXPRESSIONS**

**6.2 Title of the Work**

6.2.1.7 Initial Articles

We prefer retaining the initial article. The article belongs to certain languages and has different functions. Leaving out the article in the German language leads to grammatical changes, e.g., "Der seidene Faden" - without the article the adjective must change into "Seidener Faden" to be grammatically correct.

#### 6.2.2.11.3 Other Compilations of Two or More Works

##### *Exceptions*

"For compilations of musical works by a single composer, follow the instructions given under 6.15.2.10". There is no chapter 6.15.2.10.

## **6.10 Content Type**

A list of content type(s) needs regular updating. With respect to international data exchange, translations of terms into different languages should be taken into account. Unambiguousness is important for data transfer and a definition or even a code might help to bring together different language terms. Local systems should be expected to resolve a code into an intelligible term.

## **6.12 Language of Expression**

### 6.12.1.4 Expressions Involving More than One Language

Question: is it right, that a film version in another language is a new expression? If there are several languages or subtitles going with the film, will a new combination of each language produce another expression?

Example: Film

1. Expression: English language
2. Expression: German language
3. Expression: English and German language
4. Expression: English and German language, Hindi subtitles

Or would the 3rd expression be a part of Expression 1 and 2?

It is virtually impossible to handle this and to differentiate all these languages and subtitles as well as creating a new expression with every new subtitle.

## **6.14 Identifier for the Expression**

### 6.14.1.3 Recording Identifiers for Expressions

We recommend adding the "ISRC - International Standard Recording Code" for musical works, the "ISAN - International Standard Audiovisual Number" for audiovisual works. The "ISWC - International Standard Work Code" provides an identifier for a work and another identifier for each of its expressions. Example: ISRC: DEC610701239.

## **6.15 Title of a Musical Work**

### 6.15.2.3 Choosing the Preferred Title for a Musical Work

We recommend adding a) authority files and b) thematic indexes\* as sources.

The b) thematic index is necessary because in most cases the original edition is listed there. The thematic index number is a very important source for the identification of the work. As classical music is an international phenomenon, RDA made the decision to choose the title of the original language as the title of the work. There is a specific canon of sources for research of classical music: a) authority files, b) thematic indexes, c) New Grove, d) Die Musik in Geschichte und

Gegenwart, e) RISM. These sources should be listed in an appendix of RDA, keeping in mind that the list has to be updated regularly.

#### 6.15.2.4 Recording the Preferred Title for a Musical Work

We agree with the comment of LC and propose adding: "the title at this stage is not the preferred title; this is just the first step in arriving at a preferred title".

#### 6.15.2.5 Preferred Title Consisting Solely of the Name of One Type of Composition

We assume that the name should be recorded in singular when the composer has written only one work of the type. We would like to note that it can be time consuming and in some cases not obvious whether a composer has written only one work of that type. We recommend a uniform version (only plural or only singular - not a mixture of both). Advantages of the plural form can be seen in cases of two or more consecutively numbered parts of a musical work, e. g.: Sonaten Nr. 1-5; advantages of the singular form are that items are more easily identified, e. g.: Forellenquintett. (The singular form "Quintett" is easier to identify with "Forellenquintett" than the plural form "Quintette".)

#### 6.15.2.6 Duets

The differentiation between "duo" (instrumental) and "duet" (vocal) should be kept. Furthermore, with regard to the German language, we prefer a differentiation between "Trio" (instrumental) and "Terzett" (vocal).

#### 6.15.2.9 Compilations of Musical Works

We recommend a list of „Collective titles“ for international data exchange, with a translation of this list by every agency.

##### 6.15.2.9.6 Other Compilations

Information is missing in 6.30.1.

### **6.16 – 6.18 Medium of Performance - Key**

The included core elements should be given in every case for the field of classical music - whether it is a title consisting of solely the name of one type of composition or whether it is an individual title. The larger the catalog the more important is the listing of as many elements as possible.

Suggestion: if the medium of performance was given in any case, a new regulation should be introduced:

#### 6.16.1.xxx

(a) Do not record the medium of performance for:

- operas and other stage works
- oratorios and cantatas (including secular cantatas), unless the instrumentation differs from the form of the standard instrumentation solo voices and/or choir with an (full or string) orchestra
- masses and requiems, unless the instrumentation differs from the form of the standard instrumentation solo voices and/or choir with an (full or string) orchestra
- symphonies and overtures, unless the instrumentation differs from the standard instrumentation woodwind and/or brasses with strings
- concerti grossi

However, record the medium of performance if it is uncertain, whether the instrumentation of a musical work is in standard instrumentation as given above or not.

(b) Do not record the medium of performance for any work which instrumentation is uncertain, unknown or fully ad libitum.

#### 6.16.1.3 Recording Medium of Performance

We recommend a list of "Medium of performance" for international data exchange, with a translation of this list by every agency. Compare this to LC/12 "6.16.0.3.1 Record the medium of performance in the language preferred by the agency creating the data".

Should the standard combination not become mandatory (as suggested in the comment to 6.16.1.5), up to 9 instruments should be listed in 6.16.1.3 (instead of up to 3 instruments).

#### 6.16.1.5 Standard Combinations of Instruments

We are unclear on what is meant by the instrument combinations in 6.16.1.5. We think that it would be better to record the instruments for chamber music because these terms for standard combinations are not familiar to all users. They make it harder to compare data (automatic data exchange) and are not very appropriate for searches in online catalogues. The list given in 6.16.1.5 could be misunderstood: "strings" could mean a string trio (violin, viola, violoncello) or a string quartet (2 violins, viola, violoncello), "piano strings" could mean a) a piano trio (piano, violin, violoncello) b) a piano quartet (piano, violin, viola, violoncello), or c) a piano quintet (piano, 2 violins, viola, violoncello).

#### 6.16.1.6 Individual Instruments

We suggest that further instruments, like "treble instrument", "alto instrument" etc. be added to the list in 6.16.1.6, page 81 in accordance with "If the composition is intended for keyboard instrument but no particular instrument is named ... use keyboard instrument".

Our reason for this suggestion is that classical music of the 17th/18th century often goes without specific instrumentation (compare this to 6.15.2.7 Trio Sonatas).

#### 6.16.1.10 Solo Voices

How to handle „Edition for high voice“ or comparable cases?

#### 6.18.1.3 Recording Key

We appreciate the differentiation in 6.18.1.3 but suggest adding church modes and other tonal systems.

### **6.19 Other Distinguishing Characteristic of the Expression of a Musical Work**

#### 6.19.1.4 Arrangements, Transcriptions, etc.

Regarding arrangements in the field of pop/jazz/rock, the definition can be found in 6.19.1.4. The wording is: Arrangements, Transcriptions, etc. Apply the instructions given below for an arrangement, transcription, etc., of one or more works of one composer (or of parts of one composer's works) that falls into one or more of the following categories. If the arrangement, etc., is of a work or of part or parts of a work that belong, broadly speaking, to the category of music in the "popular" idiom (e.g., rock, jazz), record *arranged* only if the expression is: a) *either* an instrumental work arranged for vocal or choral performance b) *or* a vocal work arranged for instrumental performance. But these are only some examples of arrangements.

Further examples of expressions of modern popular music are missing. How should they be treated?

Example:

Shakira. Objection. Album version (3:44)

Shakira. Objection. Radio edit (3:29)

Shakira. Objection. Karaoke version (3:42)

Shakira. Objection. Afro punk version (3:53)

Shakira. Objection. Live MTV unplugged (3:41)

Shakira. Objection. Extended remix (4:01)

(all expressions are distinguishable by different time durations; Shakira is the performer - not the composer).

We think that it is not useful to treat possible arrangements in the field of pop/jazz/rock differently. We suggest adding the information on an arrangement (arranged) or the exact version (Radio edit; Karaoke version etc.) optionally.

## **6.27 Constructing Access Points to Represent Works and Expressions**

### 6.27.1.2 Works Created by One Person, Family, or Corporate Body

We are assuming that modern popular music pop/jazz/rock is covered by chapter 6.19.1.4. If so, it is necessary to include more examples for modern popular music. We understand that the preferred access point representing the work is constructed by combining the composer of the music and the preferred title for the work. Is that also right for pop/jazz/rock? In those cases the composer is often not known or it is difficult to identify the composer amongst a number of given names when the function or role "composer" is not added.

The general chapter 6.27.1.2 "Works created by one person, family, or corporate body" gives the example "Coldplay (Musical group). Parachutes" as preferred access point for this work. Is "Coldplay" as a musical group a composer or a performer in this example? The example is ambiguous because in the case of the CD "Parachutes", the four members of "Coldplay" are the personal names given on the CD - the placement of the names on the CD implies that the individual members of "Coldplay" could be the composers. But there is no function given.

We do understand that RDA should cover every musical genre and treat it in the same way. Thus, for a pop/jazz/rock work the composer has to be identified for the "preferred access point". The performer will be given an access point as performer. In our view it is much more practical to declare the performer - title as the preferred access point in the field of pop/jazz/rock.

### 6.27.1.3 Collaborative Works

*Exceptions, S. 145 and App. M -General comment*

Complex examples should be given in Appendix M and treated extensively on different levels (work, expression, manifestation) - also for parts of works realized by other expressions, etc. For example "Die Dreigroschenoper" (a cross between literature and music) and "Der Nussknacker", "Nutcracker" (a cross between literature, music, ballet ...). Please see the examples below. This is not only relevant for the music community. Perhaps there has to be some interchange between the literature, music, ballet, and film communities.

*Exceptions, S. 145 - Video Clips of Pop Titles*

It seems to us that video-clips (modern popular music) as an expression of pop/jazz/rock titles are missing in RDA.

*Exceptions, S. 145 - Abgrenzung Work, Expression, Manifestation*

„Moving images" as a term is too general. If it is only a question of a camera being held at a stage representation, this kind of "moving image" is part of the manifestation level (example 1.a). The

exact date of the stage representation is important to bring together manifestations of the same expression. In contrast there is the movie of the plot which is regarded as a new work (example 1.b).

#### Example 1: Carmen

##### 1.a Carmen as a picturized stage entertainment of the opera "Carmen"

The 1967 stage representation with Herbert von Karajan as conductor; Chor der Wiener Staatsoper, Wiener Philharmoniker, Grace Bumbry - Carmen, Jon Vickers - Don José, Mirella Freni - Micaëla, Justino Diaz - Escamillo, Nadine Sautereau - Frasquita, Jane Berbié - Mercédès, Gerard Dunan - Dancaire, Milen Paunov - Remendado. This stage representation (expression) is embodied in the CD of Divox, Philips Opera d'Oro and as video at DGG (Divox; Hunt CDKAR 221 (3 CD); Philips VI: 070 440 3, Philips LD: 070 440 1, Opera d'Oro CD: OPD-1151, DGG 073 403-2 (1 DVD) (live Salzburger Festspiele).

1.b Carmen - the movie - playing in the original setting of Sevilla with the singers Julia Migenes and Plácido Domingo and the director Francesco Rossi

1.b another work as an example for Carmen: as a silhouette film by Lotte Reiniger from 1933.

#### Example 2: Fantasia

For films with music, the preferred access point is the title, not the creator of the music which is included in the film. There are possible links from the music works which are included in the film to the film on the work level.

##### Example: Fantasia

Fantasia is a cartoon film of the Walt Disney Studios dating from 1940. The soundtrack consists of classical music played by the Philadelphia Orchestra, conducted by Leopold Stokowski.

The cartoons are accompanied by music and there is no speech.

Fantasia consists of 8 cartoon films corresponding to 8 music pieces. The music pieces have been cut in order to fit them to the length of each cartoon film, thus the music forms some kind of anthology.

Question: Have we understood accurately? : there is an access point for the film "Fantasia" and there are 8 access points for each cartoon plus 8 access points for each work of music? The connection between these might be realized by a link on the work level? Or on which level?

#### Example 3: Bolero ... und kein Ende

The video has been taken from TV (September 12, 1993 on 3sat = German TV) - Title "Bolero ... und kein Ende" [work]. Examples in this video can be found for examples a) (picturized stage representation) and b) (movie).

Included are works/expressions/manifestations:

3.1 A: Ravel, Maurice: Bolero. [work in work] Muti mit den Wiener Philharmonikern [expression, Date unknown]. Laser disc by Sony 1993, Wiener Philharmoniker - Anniversary Concert 150 years. (Question: unknown date - same performers and stage = same expression?).

3.2 A: Bolero. Dance [work in work] choreography by Maurice Béjart [expression of the dance], but based on the Ravel music.

3.3 B: Bolero. Cartoon [work in work] by the Italian cartoonist Bruno Bozzetto [expression]. This cartoon is included in another DVD with the title "Tutto Bozzetto" = another manifestation.

3.4 A: Ravel, Maurice: Bolero. Music [work in work] conducted by Pierre Boulez - New York Philharmonic Orchestra. [expression. Date unknown.].

3.5 A: Bolero. Dance [work in work]. choreography by Lar Lubovitch with Mia Babalis and Sylvain Lafortune. [another expression of the dance]

3.6 B: Bolero. Visualization [work in work] by Adrian Marthaler [expression of the visualization].

We would like to recommend that a complex example such as one of the above be added to Appendix M with detailed explanations.

## **6.28 Constructing Access Points to Represent Musical Works and Expressions**

### 6.28.1.1 General Guidelines on Constructing Preferred Access Points Representing Musical Works

In LC/12"6.28.1.1" „Collaborative works" are listed in a better survey than in RDA - same place.

The included reference is 6.16 (instead of 6.14)

### 6.28.1.6 Adaptations of Musical Works

Question: Is there a better definition of "commonly cited", does it refer to traditions in vocal music? Because of cultural variations, we recommend that decisions about how to handle "commonly cited" be left to the agency.

Examples:

Volksliedsätze für Chor: „Kein schöner Land..."

Die Lorelei / Worte: Heinrich Heine. Weise: Friedrich Silcher. Chorsatz: Franz Biebl. Partitur. Hammelburg : Saaleck-Verl., 1985.

### 6.28.1.7 Alterations of Musico-Dramatic Works

The „Fledermaus" the example on page 182 is not clear. Because some of the titles are films, the preferred access point should be the title (instead of Strauß).

### 6.28.1.11 Additions to Access Points with Titles Consisting of the Name of One or More Types of Composition

We prefer adding the appropriate numeral if there is more than one part for a particular instrument or voices in any case, and not only when the number is otherwise implicit. According to 6.16.1.9 the appropriate numeral in parentheses should be added after the name of that instrument (compare to comment to standard combinations in 6.16.1.5).

### 6.28.1.12 Additions to Other Access Points Representing Musical Works

In the examples the wording is "Debussy, Claude, 1862-1918. Images, piano not (piano work)", the example "Granados, Enrique, 1867-1916. Goyescas (Piano work) *not piano*" is given. This differentiation is due to the medium of performance (example Debussy) and type of work (Granados). We consider the differentiation between "piano" and "piano work" to be excessively subtle for standard cataloguing practice and too confusing for users.

### 6.28.4.4 Variant Access Point Representing a Musical Expression

*The title of the expression differs from the title of the work.*

The title of an expression should be the same as the title of a work. That is difficult when the expression is given a title other than that of the work. There are examples for that in RDA in 6.28.4.4. This title has been assigned a variant access point. In another example: titles consisting solely of a type of work on the work level change the medium of performance and/or key on the expression level - then the title of the expression is only marked by an "arranged".

Our suggestion: titles of expressions found in authority files or thematic indexes should be placed into a qualifying field. They must be separated from other variant titles. The reason for that is a better identification of the expression.

Example: Bizet

Work: Bizet, Georges: Les jeux d'enfants [title of the work] [that is: 12 pieces for piano for four hands, 1871, op. 22]

Expression: Bizet, Georges: Les jeux d'enfants / selections, arranged [title]

Bizet, Georges: Suites, 1871 [qualified variant title of the expression] [that is: orchestral version of some of the piano pieces, listed as „Suites 1871“ in the thematic index of Bizet]

## **Vision for an international authority file of works - according to the FRBR model of RDA - following App. M - RDA**

### **Work - Music**

Creator

Preferred title for the work (according to international authority files of work titles and/or thematic indexes according to an international list of thematic indexes)

Variant title for the work - English

Variant title for the work - French

Variant title for the work - German

Variant title for the work - Italian

Variant title for the work - Spanish

Variant title for the work - ...

...

Form of work

Medium of performance 1 - English

Medium of performance 1 - French

Medium of performance 1 - German

...

Medium of performance 2 - English

Medium of performance 2 - French

Medium of performance 2 - German

....

Medium of performance 3 - English

Medium of performance 3 - French

...

Numeric designation (thematic index number)

Numeric designation (Opus number)

Key - English

Key - French

Key - German

Key - Italian

...

Date of work

Identifier for the work (International Standard, like ISWC)

Identifier for the work (Number of the international authority file of works)

Identifier for the work (Library of Congress control number)

Identifier for the work (Bibliothèque Nationale de France control number)

Identifier for the work (Deutsche Nationalbibliothek control number)

Identifier for the work ...

...

Status of identification

Source consulted

### **Expression - Music**

Creator of the work

Preferred title for the work (according to international authority files of works and/or thematic indexes according to an international list of thematic indexes)

Variant title for the expression (according to the thematic index, if not other reference source from the list) - qualified field, should be differentiated from variant titles found in other sources!  
(Explanation, see 6.28.4.4)

Variant title for the expression (to be found in any source)

Variant title for the expression (to be found in any source)

Form of work

Medium of performance of the expression 1 - English

Medium of performance of the expression 1 - French

Medium of performance of the expression 1 - German

...

Medium of performance of the expression 2 - English

Medium of performance of the expression 2 - French

Medium of performance of the expression 2 - German

....

Medium of performance of the expression 3 - English

Medium of performance of the expression 3 - French

...

Numeric designation of the expression (thematic index number)

Numeric designation of the expression (Opus number)

Key of the expression - English

Key of the expression - French

Key of the expression - German

Key of the expression - Italian

...

Date of expression

Identifier for the work that is realized by the expression (Number of the international authority file of works)

Identifier for the expression (International Standard, like ISWC)

Identifier for the expression (Number of the international authority file of works)

Identifier for the expression (Library of Congress control number)

Identifier for the expression (Bibliothèque Nationale de France control number)

Identifier for the expression (Deutsche Nationalbibliothek control number)

Identifier for the expression ...

...

Status of identification

Source consulted

### **Manifestation - Music**

There is also an authority data set for a manifestation - with the identifier of the expression to reproduce the FRBR hierarchy.

According to the FRBR model each level will be represented in the lower level.

We understand that RDA concentrates on how to record data and not on how to represent them. But we feel that it is important to bear in mind that the representation of data influences how it should be recorded. We are placing our model at the end of our comments because it serves as an illustration of the suggestions we have made above. A data exchange with titles consisting of the name of one or more types of composition is quite difficult. The identification of entities is challenging, because in the field of music so many languages are used to describe one work / expression of music. Since music is international it is important to get together all variants of an entity under one title and to offer the information in a language the user is used to. That is more than a single national agency can offer. In the field of music an international "Music Agency" would be a good idea.